

Living High and Letting Die

Chapter 3: Living High, Stealing, and Letting Die

1. Surprising and Disturbing Conclusions
2. Another Option
3. Preservationist Confusions
4. The Deontologist's Argument against Stealing and Lying

The Yacht



You: A Hero

The Account



You: A Criminal

Unger's Argument

1. People's intuitions in Yacht and the Account are inconsistent.
2. If the action in the Yacht is correct, then the action in the Account is correct.
3. The action in the Yacht is correct.
4. Therefore, the action in the Account is correct.

Another Option

1. People's intuitions in Yacht and the Account are inconsistent.
2. If the action in the Yacht is correct, then the action in the Account is correct.
3. The action in the Yacht is incorrect.
4. Therefore, the action in the Account is incorrect.

Preservationist Confusions

Unger's Explanations of Preservationism are inconsistent (11, 12, 13).

**He conflates two views.
Is it preserving intuitions or deontology?**

Most deontologists will not agree that all these intuitions should be preserved, but will say that we should not lie, cheat, or steal.

The Deontologist's Argument Against Lying, Cheating and Stealing

People may make bad decisions but it's not right to deceive them.

We must always respect people and their individual decisions.

What We Can Do:

We can try to convince them of what is right.

We can pass a law against it and convict them if they transgress.

Discussion Question: Is Unger Right About Your Intuitions?



Examine the cases in Chapter 3 of Living High and Letting Die. Are there any cases that Unger presents as being good or bad from "most people's perspective" in which you have a different intuition from "most people"? Identify one such case from those we didn't discuss today. (Or if there are none, discuss the most difficult ones for you to decide on.)

Discussion Question: Is Unger Right About People's Intuitions?



Read The Yacht and The Account to three people who have not been studying ethics. Ask them whether they agree with Unger and why.